# **DESIGN REVIEW GUIDELINES**

۴.,

Adapted for Chapline Street Row Historic District

Submitted by Wheeling Historic Landmarks Commission

## INDEX

¢

Chapline Street Row Historic District	2
Chapline Street Row Historic District Design Review Guidelines	3
The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation	4
Roofs	5
Masonry	6
Wood Trim	6
Metal Trim	7
Windows	8
Entrances	9
Curbing, Walks, Fences, Trees	9
Paint Colors	10
New Construction	10
Additions or Alterations	10
Signs	10
Demolition	10
Appendix: Determination of Economic Hardship	11

#### **Chapline Street Row Historic District**

The Chapline Street Row Historic District is comprised of residences along the western side of the 2300 block of Chapline Street in Centre Wheeling.

- 2301 and 2303: The Edgar Wells House
- 2305: The Nancy Wells House
- 2307: The Holiday/Schaffer House
- 2311: The Henry Schmulbach House
- 2313: The Theodore Klieves House
- 2315: The Bernard Klieves House
- 2319: The Gregory Ackermann House
- 2321 and 2323: The Richardson House

The district is significant to Wheeling and to West Virginia as an urban middle-class and uppermiddle-class neighborhood that was largely built up during the last third of the nineteenth century. Houses within the Chapline Street Row Historic District are among the most ornate and elaborate urban homes in the region, and reflect Wheeling's industrial prominence at the time of their construction. The District contains good to outstanding examples of Italianate and Second Empire architecture, circa 1865-1885, and eclectic late Victorian structures whose design drew from Italianate, Second Empire, Romanesque, Queen Anne, and Classical Revival influences.

The Chapline Street Row Historic District took on its present form while the United States went through a period of unprecedented industrialization and urban growth. In the late nineteenth century, Wheeling's most active industries included the manufacture of glass, iron and steel, nails, tobacco processing, and water and rail commerce, including boat building and numerous wholesale activities. The size and ornamentation of homes in the Chapline Street Row Historic District illustrate the prosperity that Wheeling enjoyed during this time. Early residents of the district included owners of wholesale and retail firms, at least one prominent architect, and physicians.

Over a century after most homes in the Chapline Street Row Historic District were built, its homes continue to display their original massing and ornamentation, resulting in a historic district with a high proportion of contributing structures. Ownership of a home in the district presents a unique opportunity for stewardship of a property that is not only architecturally significant, but is also a tangible record of the social and industrial history of Wheeling. Living in the Chapline Street Row Historic District also provides the opportunity to enjoy and preserve the interiors of unusually ornate homes.

## CHAPLINE STREET ROW HISTORIC DISTRICT DESIGN REVIEW GUIDELINES

The Wheeling Historic Landmarks Commission (hereafter referred to in this document as WHLC)'s guidelines for the Chapline Street Historic District emphasize repairs and improvements that are consistent with the Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation. The WHLC's guidelines are tailored to the building types found in the Chapline Street Historic District. The Secretary of the Interior's Standards define rehabilitation as "the process of returning a property to a state of utility, through repair or alteration, which makes possible an efficient contemporary use while preserving those portions and features of the property which are significant to its historic, architectural, and cultural values".

WHLC guidelines encourage, but do not require, restoration: The historic character of a property should be retained as much as possible. Typically the period of greatest historical significance or aesthetic integrity is chosen for preservation.

WHLC guidelines will pertain to facades only and must be followed for any facade changes or additions, as detailed in this document, that are visible from the primary street. All changes are subject to review and approval by the WHLC, however changes visible from secondary streets and alleys may be given more leniency than those visible from the primary street. WHLC guidelines will not be applied to interior changes or additions, although all homeowners are urged to preserve the historical integrity of interiors.

## The Secretary of the Interior's Standards for Rehabilitation follow:

- 1. A property shall be used for a historic purpose or be placed in a new use that requires minimal change to the defining characteristics of the building and its site and environment.
- 2. The historic character of a property shall be retained and preserved. The removal of historic materials or alterations of features and spaces that characterize a property shall be avoided.
- 3. Each property shall be recognized as a physical record of its time, place, and use. Changes that create a false sense of historical development, such as adding conjectural features or architectural elements from other buildings, shall not be undertaken.
- 4. Most properties change over time; those changes that have acquired historic significance in their own right shall be retained and preserved.
- 5. Distinctive features, finishes, and construction techniques or examples of craftsmanship that characterize a property shall be preserved.
- 6. Deteriorated historic features shall be repaired rather than replaced. Where the severity of deterioration requires replacement of a distinctive feature, the new feature shall match the old in design, color, texture, and other visual qualities and, where possible, materials. Replacement of missing features shall be substantiated by documentary, physical, or pictorial evidence.
- 7. Chemical or physical treatments, such as sandblasting, that cause damage to historic materials shall not be used. The surface cleaning of structures, if appropriate, shall be undertaken using the gentlest means possible.
- 8. Significant archeological resources affected by a project shall be protected and preserved. If such resources must be disturbed, mitigation measures shall be undertaken.
- 9. New additions, exterior alterations, or related new construction shall not destroy historic materials that characterize the property. The new work shall be differentiated from the old and shall be compatible with the massing, size, scale, and architectural features to protect the historic integrity of the property and its environment.
- 10. New additions and adjacent or related new construction shall be undertaken in such a manner that if removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the historic property and its environment would be unimpaired.

### **Design Review Guidelines for Rehabilitation and Maintenance**

#### Roofs

It is recommended that homeowners make every attempt to maintain an existing slate roof, particularly on a mansard roof. If it is necessary for a homeowner to replace an existing slate roof with materials other than slate, simulated materials should be used that match in color and character to the original material The design of all homes in the Chapline Street Row Historic District should be considered when choosing roofing material. All roofing materials and colors used requires approval by the WHLC

Installation of skylights may be approved, providing they are not visible from the primary streets. Visible alteration of roof contours by the construction of dormers, other window openings, turrets, skylights, or vents is not permitted without WHLC review. In the event that it is necessary to install mechanical equipment on a roof within the historic district, such equipment should be placed so that it is inconspicuous from the sidewalk and street. Placement that makes the equipment impossible to see from the sidewalk and street is always preferable. Any alteration of a roof requires approval by the WHLC.

Wood cornices that conceal box gutters are important components of the facades of homes in the Chapline Street Row Historic District. Homeowners are strongly encouraged to retain wood cornices and box gutters rather than replacing them with modem gutters

Conjectural use of wrought iron cresting and finials is not recommended. Homeowners considering either of these options should review their restoration plans with the WHLC.

#### <u>Masonry</u>

Retention of exterior wall surfaces is an important part of preservation of the Chapline Street Row Historic District. The WHLC is unlikely to approve installation of any simulated materials on the front or public facade of any structure in the Chapline Street Row Historic District, including stucco, aluminum or vinyl siding, stone, brick veneer, or any other surface material that was unavailable or unlikely to be used at the time of construction. The WHLC may consider use of simulated materials on cornices and their returns when the work can be demonstrated to duplicate the original details and appearance.

Property owners in the Chapline Street Row Historic District must request WHLC approval to remove historic masonry, or to make changes that alter or diminish the character of historic masonry. Any repairs to historic masonry should be made using material that matches the original masonry as closely as possible in color, size, and texture.

Painting of unpainted masonry facades is unacceptable. Repainting a facade that is already painted is permitted.

Removing paint from a masonry facade that has previously been painted may be considered if the structure was not historically painted, and if removal can be accomplished without damaging the masonry.

#### Wood Trim

Preservation and retention of ornamental wood is essential to the integrity of the Chapline Street Row Historic District. Protecting ornamental wood from water damage will eliminate the need for most repairs. It is important to keep ornamental wood painted and to take any other necessary measures to keep water from accumulating. These measures include maintenance and cleaning of gutters and downspouts, proper flashing, and removing or preventing growth of ivy.

Discretionary removal or alteration of any exterior wood trim should be avoided. If deterioration of exterior wood has progressed to the point that removal of a deteriorated section is the only feasible response, work should not include removal of other trim that is in better condition and can be retained. Any trim that must be removed should not be replaced with trim that is modem in appearance or otherwise does not match the historic ornamentation. Any new wood ornamentation should duplicate the old ornamentation as closely as possible.

Conjectural application of exterior wood, that is not documented, including "gingerbread" and colonial-era ornamentation, is not recommended. Homeowners should take care to ensure that any wood trim to be installed matches the original trim in the same site as closely as possible. Homeowners considering work of this type should review their restoration plans with the WHLC.

#### Metal Trim

Metal exterior trim, also known as architectural metal, in the Chapline Street Row Historic District includes pressed tin cornices, friezes, and other metal ornamentation. It is important to ensure that water does not stand or accumulate in a way that will cause corrosion of architectural metals. Identifying the type of metal used in an architectural feature is also important in its preservation. The type of metal will determine whether cleaning is appropriate, the method of cleaning, if any, and whether painting is appropriate.

Discretionary removal or alteration of any architectural metal should be avoided. If deterioration of architectural metal progresses to the point that removal of a deteriorated section is the only feasible response, work should not include removal of any metal trim that is in better condition and can be retained. Any architectural metal that must be removed should not be replaced with metal trim or other trim that is modem in appearance or otherwise does not match the historic ornamentation. Any new architectural metal should duplicate the old ornamentation as closely as possible.

Conjectural application which is not documented of exterior architectural metal is not recommended. Homeowners considering work of this type should review their restoration plans with the WHLC.

7

#### <u>Windows</u>

Maintenance of windows, including painting sashes and replacing broken glazing, helps prevent the need to repair and replace window sashes. It is almost always advisable for aesthetic and financial reasons to attempt-to repair historic windows before resorting to replacement. Replacement of windows must be approved by the WHLC. If replacement is deemed necessary, the homeowner must submit a request, along with the specifications of the replacement window, for consideration.

The WHLC will not approve creation of new window openings and eliminating existing historical window openings. Homeowners may not reduce, expand, or otherwise change the size or shape of historic window openings. Prohibited reduction of window openings includes use of brick, wood, or any other material to reduce opening size. Deteriorated sashes and glazing should be repaired when possible; replacement should be in kind, replicating materials and pane configuration.

WHLC may approve installation of stained or leaded glass windows and iron security grills of a simple nature.

Exterior window shutters should only be installed where historical evidence such as photographs or remaining hardware - documents their previous use. Replacement exterior shutters must be operable. Exterior shutters constructed of aluminum and vinyl are inappropriate, as are those which do not match the size and shape of the openings they flank.

Cellar windows should be preserved; eliminating cellar windows and use of glass block are not recommended. Some homeowners with concerns about home security have chosen to install interior horizontal iron bars behind original operable cellar windows, creating a barrier that is not visible from the street.

Exterior storm windows should not be applied to the front facades of homes in the Chapline Street Row Historic District; interior use is acceptable. Installation of storm windows and screens constructed of a narrow frame, and the same color as the adjoining trim, may be acceptable on the facade; providing, when installed, they will not alter the visual effect of the window openings

#### **Entrances**

Original doors should be preserved and repaired whenever possible. If it is impossible to retain an original door, a replacement door should match the original as closely as possible in panel configuration, trim profile, and any other ornamentation. It is not acceptable to replace double doors with a single door. Transoms should also be retained in their original configuration, when possible.

Storm doors, if necessary, should be made of wood. Use of aluminum storm doors is not recommended.

Houses in the Chapline Street Row Historic District were typically built without front porches, like many other middle-class urban residences constructed in the last decades of the nineteenth century. Addition of a front porch to a house that was constructed without one is not appropriate

Homes in the Chapline Street Row Historic District were constructed with front steps of cut stone. These steps contribute to the integrity of the houses to which they lead, and should be retained wherever possible. Discretionary removal of cut stone front steps and replacement with steps constructed with concrete or other materials is not recommended and requires approval by the WHLC.

WHLC staff may approve iron security doors of a simple nature. Staff approval may also be given for installation on visible side facades for storm doors constructed of a narrow frame and of the same color as the adjoining trim and which, when installed, will not alter the visual effect of the openings

#### Curbing, Walks, Fences, Trees

District homes include stone curbing, iron fences and gates. Chapline Street homeowners are encouraged to retain these existing elements. Removal of these features requires WHLC review and approval

No approval is required for simple landscaping such as flowers and shrubs; however WHLC approval is necessary before planting trees between the street and the front facade. If approval should be given for tree planting the homeowner is responsible for maintaining the tree for the life of the tree and must ensure the tree's size and scale are kept in perspective with the historic district and must also ensure that the tree does not obscure the view of the facade.

Visible decks, porches, storage bins, garages, playhouses, and satellite dishes require WHLC approval.

#### **Paint Colors**

A wide range of historic colors will be selected by the Chapline Row homeowners. Before a homeowner paints color choices must be submitted to the WHLC for review and approval.

#### **New Construction**

The WHLC must review proposals for any new construction in the Chapline Street Row Historic District to ensure compatibility with existing buildings. Criteria for review of proposed new construction will include proposed setback, height, scale, massing, and proportion of window openings.

#### Additions or Alterations

All proposed additions or alterations to structures in the Chapline Street Row Historic District must be reviewed and approved by the WHLC.

#### <u>Signs</u>

Approval from the WHLC is required for installation of all signs

No WHLC or staff approval is required for the removal of signs.

No WHLC or staff approval is required for temporary yard signs or banners

#### **Demolition**

There shall be a presumption toward retaining all existing building within the Chapline Street Row Historic District, and every effort will be made to do so.

Demolition shall only be permitted if and when all requirements listed below are satisfied.

- True economic hardship must be proven. (See Appendix for criteria that must be met)
- If an applicant's request for permission to demolish a structure or part of a structure is based upon structural instability or advanced deterioration, a technical report prepared by an architect or professional engineer registered in West Virginia shall be submitted, detailing the nature and extent of the specific problems, and providing reasonably accurate cost estimates for their correction.
- A Certificate of Appropriateness application for the demolition of existing structures shall be accompanied by complete plans for the new development proposed on the site, together with a timetable and a budget for the demolition and the reconstruction as well as satisfactory evidence that adequate financing is available.

#### APPENDIX: Determination of Economic Hardship

All Certificate of Appropriateness applications for demolition shall contain a Statement of Economic Hardship. The WHLC shall schedule a public hearing concerning the application and any person may testify at the hearing concerning economic hardship.

The WHLC may solicit expert testimony or require that the applicant for a certificate for demolition make submissions concerning economic hardship.

The WHLC may solicit expert testimony or require that the applicant make submissions concerning any or all of the following information before it makes a determination on the application.

- I. Estimate of the cost of the proposed construction, alteration, demolition, or removal and an estimate of additional costs that would be incurred to comply with the standards of the WHLC for changes necessary for the issuance of a Certificate of appropriateness.
- 2. A report from a licensed engineer or architect with experience in rehabilitation as to the structural soundness of any structures on the property and their suitability for rehabilitation.
- 3. Estimated market value of the property in its current condition; after completion of the proposed construction, alteration, demolition, or removal; after any changes required by the WHLC; and, in the case of a proposed demolition, after renovation of the existing property for continued use.
- 4. In the case of a proposed demolition, an estimate from an architect, developer, real estate consultant, appraiser, or other real estate professional experienced in rehabilitation as to the economic feasibility of rehabilitation or reuse of the existing structure on the property.
- 5. Amount paid for the property, the date of purchase, and the party from whom purchased, including a description of the relationship, if any, between the owner of record or applicant and the person from whom the property was purchased, and any terms of financing between the seller and buyer.
- 6. If the property is income producing, the annual gross income from the property for the previous two years; itemized operating and maintenance expenses for the previous two years; and depreciation deduction and annual cash flow before and after debt service, if any, during the same period.
- 7. Remaining balance of any mortgage or other financing secured by the property and annual debt service, if any, for the previous two years.
- 8. All appraisals obtained within the previous two years by the owner or applicant in connection with the purchase, financing, or ownership of the property.
- 9. Any listing of the property for sale or rent, price asked, offers received, if any, within the previous two years.
- 10. Assessed value of the property according to two most recent assessments.
- II. Real estate taxes for the previous two years.

12. Form of ownership or operation of the property, whether sole proprietorship, for profit or not-for-profit corporation, limited partnership, joint venture, or other.

NE STREET WELT VIGUNIA	ONENBERGER, SPRING 1980, CRANER & PARSONS, 1984, Marker Derton CONTY CONTY OF CONTY OF CONTY OF CONTY	C L HALL, ED FREEMAN, INKED 3Y RICHARD CR - WEGT THE MAGNING SUPPORT - NET HALL, ED FREEMAN, INKED 3Y RICHARD CR - HALL, ED FREEMAN, INFERAND CR - HALL, ED	RAM VE AWAR NULTITIK A NO 201710 A NULTIK A NULTIK A NULTIK A NULTIK A NULTIK A NULTIK A NULTIK
		WELLS HOUSE	
s undertaken by the His- Jildnes Survey under the in normeters, chief of on with the friends of ond adam was measured and drawn from the trenting of the m. M. Crae (and the trenticitar) operaan, (pennsylvania) operaan, (pe			
THIS PROJECT WA TORG AMERICAN BI DIRECTION OF JOH HABS, N COOPERAN HABS, N COOPERAN WHEELING INC. IT DURING THE SMA SUPERVISION OF JO HALL, F STATE UNIVERSIT (ARTZONA STATE U (MISSISSIPPI STATE (ATZONA STATE U (MISSISSIPPI STATE U (MISSISSIPI STATE U (MISSISSIPPI STATE U (MISSISSIPPI STATE U (MISSISSIPPI STATE U (MISSISSIPI STATE STATE U (MISSISSIPI STATE STAT		HOLLINAY HOUSE	
		SCHAULBACH HOUSE	
LE STREET HAS LE WHEELING'S ER ONE HUNDRED URES SELECTED URET. THEY POS- ULT. THEY POS- ULT. THEY POS- ULT. THEY POS- ULT. THEY ARCH- ALE, RELATIVE ALE, RELATIVE ALE, RELATIVE ALE, RELATIVE ALE, RELATIVE CORRAMAN - HBORHOOD OF HBORHOOD OF LECTIVELY CRE- MINETEENTH		T KLIEVES HOLSE	
THE 2300 BLOCK OF CHAPLE BEEN AN INTEGRAL PART O URBAN STREETSCAPE FOR OV VEARS. THE SEVEN STRUCTI FOR STUDY BY THS SURVEYURT FOR STUDY BY THS SURVEYERS SESS A STRONG OF EXENT OUTTLE SINCE THE SUMLARTY O THEOTHAL DESINC HEES RESULT OF THE SIMLARTY O THE GENERAL HOMOGENEITY SHEP HAVE PRODUCED A NEIG INDIVIDUAL UNTS WHCH COL INDIVIDUAL UNTS WHCH COL		B KLIEVES HOLE	
	D BLOCK OF CHAPLINE STREET HAS INTEGRAL PART OF WHEELING'S REETSCAPE FOR OVER ONE HUNDRED HE STVM STRUCTURES SELECTED HE STVM STRUCTURES SELECTED HE STVM STRUCTURES SELECTED HE STVM STRUCTURES SELECTED HE STVM STRUCTURES SELECTED HES STATEWARE CHARGE HARS, NO COPERATION WITH THE FRIENDS OF HARS, NO COPERATION FOR THE STATE SIMMER OF JOINT AND ET ES SIMMER OF JOINT AND STATE UNIVERSITY, EDWARD OF HARS AND STATE UNIVERSITY, EDWARD C FREEMAN STATE UNIVERSITY, EDWARD C FREEMAN STATE UNIVERSITY, ALTHE O, WILEY (MASSISSIPPI STATE UNIVERSITY), ALTHE O, MILEY (MASSISSIPPI STATE UNIVERSITY), AND ARCHEGO (MASSISSIPPI STATE UNIVERSITY), AND ARCHEGO (MASSIS	Tre 200 BLOOK OF GAMUE STRETT MA The STRETT AND THE THE STRETT AND THE STRETT AN	The Condition of the Condi

